

Plato's Republic, Books 6-10

The Purpose of Philosophy, and the Pathway to the Good

By Richard J. Walters Jr.

Overview

Having sufficiently defined the meaning of “justice” in the first half, the second half of Plato's Republic explores whether Socrates' perfect state could actually exist. More than any other utopic vision, Plato realizes that there is an underlying “chicken and egg” problem that prevents his Republic from being created. For any perfect state to exist, you have to have perfect people. But, the point of the perfect state is to make it possible for people to be able to achieve perfection.

Plato is fighting against a low public assessment of Philosophers in general, and yet he is making the claim that only a philosopher should be given the reigns to the state. True philosophers seek after the “essence” of things through trained use of the “dialectic.” Pretenders or “Sophists” masquerading as philosophers have sullied the reputation of the noble art. Socrates' task is to restore faith in true philosophy, and lay down a pathway that will lead future rulers to knowledge of “the Good.” And then, it is necessary that those trained rulers return to the world of shadows, to safeguard the essence of justice.

Some Basic Themes of the Republic

- There is a “real” and “unchanging” world beyond our reality. This is Plato's world of the Forms. You can imagine it to be the blueprint for reality.
- There is a single author of all creation, referred to as God, or “The Good.” God created the blueprint, which is more real than our world.
- If a perfect society is ever to exist, then it must be ruled by a Philosopher King. Only a philosopher king would understand the true essence of virtues such as Justice, Wisdom, Courage and Temperance. Therefore, only a Philosopher King could safeguard the state.
- Creation is divided into different levels. God creates the Forms, or the blueprint. In our changeable “instance” of reality, we have workmen who craft and create many items partaking in the form of the actual item made by God. And then there are those who describe the material things, who are not better than imitators of shadows; twice removed from the truth.

Quick Outline

- Book 6 <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=t2R1pTmAdI0>
 - Continues the discussion about the perfect state from Book 5
 - Socrates insists that the ruler of the perfect state will need to be a philosopher (philosopher king)
 - But "philosophers" in his time have garnered a bad reputation for sophistry
 - Socrates offers a defense of philosophy
 - Socrates uses an analogy of a Sailor to convey his meaning here.
 - The conclusion is that the ideal ruler must understand the virtues to protect them, so he must be a philosopher.
 - That settled, the others beg Socrates to explain his understanding of "the Good," the contemplation of which is the highest aim of Philosophy
 - Socrates details the "Allegory of the Sun" (which is famous)
 - Next Socrates elaborates further on his Sun Allegory, with what is now called "the Divided Line"
- Book 7 <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=t1kVAz0JeaE&t=409s>
 - Book seven starts with Socrates' most famous allegory, the "**Allegory of the Cave**"
 - This allegory concludes with the imperative that young philosophers must be compelled to return to the cave to help those who are still chained to the wall.
 - The discussion turns to "how" a guardian should be trained. Specifically, they need to know what subjects of study lead the mind to an understanding of the Good. The following subjects are recommended, in this order:
 - Arithmetic (number in theory, which leads to an understanding of oneness)
 - Geometry (number in two dimension, superficies)
 - Geometry of Solids
 - Astronomy (solids in motion, or physics)
 - Music (harmony)
 - Hymn of Dialectic (the art of questioning to find the "essence" of a thing, as well as rhetoric)
 - The discussion ends with who should be trained and at what age.
 - The company concludes their discussion on the perfect state.
- Book 8 <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=DNT5BvXg27I&t=213s>
 - The initial reason for the creation of the ideal state was to determine who would be truly happier, the unjust or the just man, and which lifestyle was better. Socrates could not define "justice," and so he wanted to try to find it in a state, so that they could possibly locate it in the individual. The perfect state

- was the most likely place to find justice, so they created that state. And they found justice in Book 5.
- Now we return to trying to determine which type of person is happiest. So, they reason that people govern themselves much the same way as states govern. So, they decide to pick a "typical" man from each of 5 types of government to compare which constitution is best. And, then they will decide which of these is likely to be happiest. The 5 states are:

 - Aristocracy (government of the best)
 - Timocracy (government of honor)
 - Oligarchy (government of the rich)
 - Democracy (government of the people)
 - Tyranny (government of the powerful)

 - They examine:

 - How Aristocracy changes to Timocracy
 - The Timocratic Man
 - How Timocracy changes to Oligarchy
 - The Oligarchical Man
 - How Oligarchy changes to Democracy
 - The Democratic Man
 - **How Democracy changes to Tyranny**
 - The Tyrant

 - Book 9 <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=G782LXz3vnM&t=19s>

 - There is a wild beast nature of our dreams that we must control while awake.
 - The tyrant is one who can't control his passions. He is ruled by love and his desires.
 - Socrates then concludes the discussion regarding which of the five representative men is "happiest."

 - Book 10 <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=E6cPRMV8hVE>

 - Socrates goes on the attack against poets and tragedians. He uses Homer as the exemplar, and shows that if even Homer is nothing but an imitator of truth, and his writings are not fit to implement as a system (contrasted with the works of Pythagoras); then none of the tragedians of his time are worthy to be followed as if they were philosophies.

 - Socrates relates a vision of the afterlife, and proposes that the immortality of the soul can be proven.
 - Socrates redeems all philosophy and everything is perfect in the world... etc.. etc.

Detailed Outline

Book 6

1. Begin talking about the necessity of the ruler of the perfect state to be a philosopher.
2. Review of desired qualities of a ruler:
 - a. Truthfulness.
 - b. Temperate.
 - c. Drawn toward Wisdom.
 - d. Magnificence.
 - e. Courageous.
 - f. Not covetous.
 - g. Just and Gentle.
 - h. Good memory.
 - i. Harmonious.
 - j. Proportionate.
 - k. Gracious.
 - l. Moves toward the true being of everything.
3. Adeimantus interjects with a critique of Socrates' use of dialectic. Is his expert skill with dialectic not what causes people to be led astray?
 - a. "To these statements, Socrates, no one can offer a reply; but when you talk in this way, a strange feeling passes over the minds of your hearers: They fancy that they are led astray a little at each step in the argument, owing to their own want of skill in asking and answering questions; these littles accumulate, and at the end of the discussion they are found to have sustained a mighty overthrow and all their former notions appear to be turned upside down. And as unskilful players of draughts are at last shut up by their more skilful adversaries and have no piece to move, so they too find themselves shut up at last; for they have nothing to say in this new game of which words are the counters; and yet all the time they are in the right. The observation is suggested to me by what is now occurring. For any one of us might say, that although although in words he is not able to meet you at each step of the argument, he sees as a fact that the votaries of philosophy, when they carry on the study, not only in youth as a part of education, but as the pursuit of their maturer years, most of them become strange monsters, not to say utter rogues, and that those who may be considered the best of them are made useless to the world by the very study which you extol."
4. Sparks a debate about the usefulness of philosophers.
5. Parable of the sailor.
 - a. Explains why people don't esteem philosophers.
6. Sadly, corruption of the majority is seems unavoidable.
 - a. What is the ideal? p.116
 - i. "... that the true lover of knowledge is always striving after being—that is his nature; he will not rest in the multiplicity of individuals which is an appearance only, but will go on—the keen edge will not be blunted, nor the force of his desire abate until he have attained the knowledge of the true nature of every essence by a sympathetic and kindred power in the soul, and by that power drawing near and mingling and becoming incorporate with very being, having

begotten mind and truth, he will have knowledge and will live and grow truly, and then, and not till then, will he cease from his travail.

- b. Why are the majority bad, meaning “spoiled” (useless, not wicked).
 - c. Socrates speaks of “the imitators of philosophy, what manner of men are they who aspire after a profession which is above them and of which they are unworthy.” It is they who bring disrepute on philosophy.
 - d. He talks of corrupting forces. Virtue and then temptations.
 - e. He uses an analogy of a plant which is similar to parable of sower in New Testament, which brings the corruption of the would-be philosopher.
 - f. So, environment is to blame?
 - g. Can a youth stand against all of the distractions and peer pressure?
 - i. Speaking of the fantastic show of the Sophists, he says: “When they meet together, and the world sits down at an assembly, or in a court of law, or a theatre, or a camp, or in any other popular resort, and there is a great uproar, and they praise some things which are being said or done, and blame other things, equally exaggerating both, shouting and clapping their hands, and the echo of the rocks and the place in which they are assembled redoubles the sound of the praise or blame—at such a time will not a young man's heart, as they say, leap within him? Will any private training enable him to stand firm against the overwhelming flood of popular opinion? or will he be carried away by the stream? Will he not have the notions of good and evil which the public in general have—he will do as they do, and as they are, such will he be?”
 - ii. Blaming the Sophists he says: “... all those mercenary individuals, whom the many call Sophists and whom they deem to be their adversaries, do, in fact, teach nothing but the opinion of the many, that is to say, the opinions of their assemblies; and this is their wisdom.” P.118.
 - h. Socrates the Allegory of the Beast Master
 - i. This master learns the way of one beast only, and then applies the lesson to other things that are not related.
 - i. Difference between “many beautiful” and “absolute beauty”
 - “Then let me ask you to consider further whether the world will ever be induced to believe in the existence of absolute beauty rather than of the many beautiful, or of the absolute in each kind rather than of the many in each kind?”
 - “Certainly not.”
 - “Then the world cannot possibly be a philosopher?”
 - “Impossible.”
 - “And therefore philosophers must inevitably fall under the censure of the world?”
 - “They must.”
 - “And of individuals who consort with the mob and seek to please them?”
 - “That is evident.”
 - “Then, do you see any way in which the philosopher can be preserved in his calling to the end?”
7. Can anyone escape the flatterers?
- a. So even the best can become a great good, or great evil.
 - b. Even ignoble/uneducated people are attracted to Philosophy. These unworthy individuals create sophisms.
 - c. Metaphor of a man who fell among wild beasts. Some just fly under the radar.

- i. “Those who belong to this small class have tasted how sweet and blessed a possession philosophy is, and have also seen enough of the madness of the multitude; and they know that no politician is honest, nor is there any champion of justice at whose side they may fight and be saved. Such an one may be compared to a man who has fallen among wild beasts—he will not join in the wickedness of his fellows, but neither is he able singly to resist all their fierce natures, and therefore seeing that he would be of no use to the State or to his friends, and reflecting that he would have to throw away his life without doing any good either to himself or others, he holds his peace, and goes his own way. He is like one who, in the storm of dust and sleet which the driving wind hurries along, retires under the shelter of a wall; and seeing the rest of mankind full of wickedness, he is content, if only he can live his own life and be pure from evil or unrighteousness, and depart in peace and good-will, with bright hopes.”
P.120

- d. He is content to live his life and avoid evil and unrighteousness.
8. Which government now existing is worthy of philosophic nature.
 - a. None of them.
 - b. The perfect state will always require good people to keep it.
 - c. Start of how to teach the youth.
 - i. when young, make philosophy like play.
 - d. Are we (philosophers) "dreamers and visionaries" for believing that the perfect state governed by a true philosopher could come to be?
 - e. Generally harsh sentiments toward philosophy come from the pretenders, not true philosophers.
 - f. How can the population be convinced that a true philosopher will do better at creating the perfect state and constitution?
 - g. Socrates describes how the philosopher will wipe the slate clean and how he will write the new constitution looking both upward and downward for inspiration, and testing the formula by introspection and example in men.
 - h. Settles the point that people will not be angry with their statement that philosophers should rule, after this argumentation
 - i. But what of the sons of kings and princes? What if one of those sons happens to be a philosopher by nature? He suggests that if just one should escape being killed, he might bring about the ideal polity.
 - j. So, Socrates concludes that it is "possible" that their ideal Republic could come to existence.
 9. Future plan: Talk about education that leads to true philosophy. And, at what ages they should take up each pursuit.
 10. But first, we must talk about the rulers.
 - a. Must be patriots. They must be tried in the "refiner's fire."
 - b. Must be a philosopher.
 - c. Rare to have all of the gifts in one person.
 - i. On the one hand, the high spirited cannot live in a peaceful and settled manner.
 1. “You are aware, I replied, that quick intelligence, memory, sagacity, cleverness, and similar qualities, do not often grow together, and that persons who possess them and are at the same time high-spirited and magnanimous are not so constituted by nature as to live orderly and in

a peaceful and settled manner; they are driven any way by their impulses, and all solid principle goes out of them." P.125

- ii. On the other hand, those of a steadfast nature are immovable even when there is something to be learned.
 1. "On the other hand, those steadfast natures which can better be depended upon, which in a battle are impregnable to fear and immovable, are equally immovable when there is anything to be learned; they are always in a torpid state, and are apt to yawn and go to sleep over any intellectual toil." P.125
 - d. There must be a balance (temperance) between them.
 - e. Any who wish to see justice, temperance, courage and wisdom in their beauty, must take the longer, circuitous way. p.126
11. "What, he said, is there a knowledge still higher than this—higher than justice and the other virtues? Yes, I said, there is. And of the virtues too we must behold not the outline merely, as at present—nothing short of the most finished picture should satisfy us." p.126
12. "you have often been told that the idea of good is the highest knowledge, and that all other things become useful and advantageous only by their use of this." p.126
- a. The ruler must have knowledge of the "good." And if he does, the state will be perfectly ordered.
13. The others beg Socrates to give an account of the Good.
- a. He assents to speak of the child of the Good.
14. Allegory of the Sun.
- "The old story, that there is a many beautiful and a many good, and so of other things which we describe and define; to all of them the term 'many' is applied."
- "True, he said."
- "And there is an absolute beauty and an absolute good, and of other things to which the term 'many' is applied there is an absolute; for they may be brought under a single idea, which is called the essence of each."
- "Very true."
- "The many, as we say, are seen but not known, and the ideas are known but not seen."
- "Exactly."
- "And what is the organ with which we see the visible things? The sight, he said. And with the hearing, I said, we hear, and with the other senses perceive the other objects of sense?"
- "True."
- "But have you remarked that sight is by far the most costly and complex piece of workmanship which the artificer of the senses ever contrived?"
- "No, I never have, he said."
- "Then reflect; has the ear or voice need of any third or additional nature in order that the one may be able to hear and the other to be heard?"
- "Nothing of the sort."
- "No, indeed, I replied; and the same is true of most, if not all, the other senses—you would not say that any of them requires such an addition?"
- "Certainly not."
- "But you see that without the addition of some other nature there is no seeing or being seen?"
- "How do you mean?"

"Sight being, as I conceive, in the eyes, and he who has eyes wanting to see; colour being also present in them, still unless there be a third nature specially adapted to the purpose, the owner of the eyes will see nothing and the colours will be invisible. Of what nature are you speaking? Of that which you term light, I replied."

"True, he said."

"Noble, then, is the bond which links together sight and visibility, and great beyond other bonds by no small difference of nature; for light is their bond, and light is no ignoble thing?"

"Nay, he said, the reverse of ignoble."

"And which, I said, of the gods in heaven would you say was the lord of this element? Whose is that light which makes the eye to see perfectly and the visible to appear?"

"You mean the sun, as you and all mankind say."

"May not the relation of sight to this deity be described as follows?"

"How?"

"Neither sight nor the eye in which sight resides is the sun?"

"No."

"Yet of all the organs of sense the eye is the most like the sun?"

"By far the most like."

"And the power which the eye possesses is a sort of effluence which is dispensed from the sun?"

"Exactly."

"Then the sun is not sight, but the author of sight who is recognised by sight?"

"True, he said."

"And this is he whom I call the child of the good, whom the good begat in his own likeness, to be in the visible world, in relation to sight and the things of sight, what the good is in the intellectual world in relation to mind and the things of mind:"

"Will you be a little more explicit? he said."

"Why, you know, I said, that the eyes, when a person directs them towards objects on which the light of day is no longer shining, but the moon and stars only, see dimly, and are nearly blind; they seem to have no clearness of vision in them?"

"Very true."

"But when they are directed towards objects on which the sun shines, they see clearly and there is sight in them?"

"Certainly."

"And the soul is like the eye: when resting upon that on which truth and being shine, the soul perceives and understands, and is radiant with intelligence; but when turned towards the twilight of becoming and perishing, then she has opinion only, and goes blinking about, and is first of one opinion and then of another, and seems to have no intelligence?"

"Just so."

"Now, that which imparts truth to the known and the power of knowing to the knower is what I would have you term the idea of good, and this you will deem to be the cause of science, and of truth in so far as the latter becomes the subject of knowledge; beautiful too, as are both truth and knowledge, you will be right in esteeming this other nature as more beautiful than either; and, as in the previous instance, light and sight may be truly said to be like the sun, and yet not to be the sun, so in this other sphere, science and truth may be deemed to be like the good, but not the good; the good has a place of honour yet higher."

“What a wonder of beauty that must be, he said, which is the author of science and truth, and yet surpasses them in beauty; for you surely cannot mean to say that pleasure is the good?”

“God forbid, I replied; but may I ask you to consider the image in another point of view? In what point of view?”

“You would say, would you not, that the sun is not only the author of visibility in all visible things, but of generation and nourishment and growth, though he himself is not generation?”

“Certainly.”

“In like manner the good may be said to be not only the author of knowledge to all things known, but of their being and essence, and yet the good is not essence, but far exceeds essence in dignity and power.” P.129

15. Allegory of the Divided Line.

**Intelligible
(knowlege)**

Unchanging world
of "being"

**Noesis
(rational forms)**

Perfect ideas and concepts like
Beauty, Justice and the Good

**Dianoia
(logical forms)**

Mathematics and Geometry

**Visible
(opinion)**

Changeable world
that is "becoming"

**Pistis
(faith or belief)**

Physical Objects

**Eikasia
(imagination)**

Shadows and images

Book 7



1. Allegory of the Cave
 - a. Conclusion that one who came back into the cave, that person would not be an expert at judging the shadows, but rather an expert of true objects.
 - b. Conclusion that you can't put knowledge into the soul any more than you can put sight into blind eyes. "Learning exists in the soul already." p.134
 - c. But, all of the so-called virtues can be implanted by habit and exercise. All except for "wisdom" which contains "a divine element."
 - d. It will be the business of the founders of the state to "compel the trained guardians to descend again among the prisoners in the den, and partake of their labors and honours, whether they are worth having or not." p.135
2. How will the guardians be trained?
 - a. Gymnastic is no good.
 - b. Music is also no good.
 - c. The special arts are no good.
3. Socrates' Education Ladder
 - a. Arithmetic and Calculation
 - i. Example of the fingers
 - b. Geometry of superficies

- c. Geometry of solids
 - d. Astronomy (physics, or motion of solids)
 - e. Music and Harmony
 - f. Hymn of Dialectic p.144
4. Who should they teach?
- a. Rehash of earlier points.
 - b. Men must be free to learn of their own volition.
 - c. "Let early education be a sort of amusement." p. 147
 - d. Ages for each study.
 - e. Early age - Gymnastic and Play at Learning
 - f. 20 years - Bring studies together.
 - g. 30 years - Chosen and elevated, when proven with dialectic. And then taught dialectic. But caution is required such that more evil will not be brought into the world through misuse of dialectic.
 - h. Allegory of the Unwitting Adoptee
 - i. Study philosophy for 5 years.
 - j. 35 years - sent into the caves for 15 years.
 - k. 50 years - those distinguished gentlemen who survive, will take a hand at politics. And they will make philosophy their chief pursuit that they might know of truth.
5. End to describing the perfect state.

Book 8

1. Review of points made about the perfect state.
2. The ultimate goal. 5 forms of government, and 5 constitutions of individuals. If each state is imagined as an individual, could that person be happy?
 - a. Aristocracy - Government of the Best
 - b. Timocracy - Government of Honor
 - c. Oligarchy - Government of the Rich
 - d. Democracy - Government of the People
 - e. Tyranny - Government of the Powerful
3. Change from Aristocracy to Timocracy.
 - a. Story about bad births, mixing gold and silver with iron and brass.
4. Who is the Timocratical Man and how is he made.
 - a. Son is drawn in opposite ways from his temperate father. He gives up the middle kingdom to the principle of contentiousness and passion. He becomes arrogant and ambitious.
5. Change from Timocracy to Oligarchy.
 - a. The accumulation of gold by private individuals. And the mass of citizens become lovers of money. p. 156
 - b. They make a ruler of the rich man.
 - c. What if pilots were chosen on account of their property?
 - d. Division of the state into two. One of the Rich and one of the Poor.
 - e. Cannot call the people out to war for fear of arming them.
 - f. Individual oligarchs have many pursuits, instead of specializing in one.
 - g. Evil of the spendthrift.
 - h. Paupers and thieves (drones with and without stings)
6. Who is the Oligarchical man, and how is he made?
 - a. Son of a ruined man. Takes to moneymaking and puts together a fortune. Wants to make himself a king again.
 - b. Worships only the acquisition of wealth.
 - c. He subdues his unprofitable desires.
 - i. "He is a shabby fellow, who saves something out of everything and makes a purse for himself; and this is the sort of man whom the vulgar applaud." P.158
 - ii. He "made a blind god director of his chorus, or given him chief honour." P. 158
 - d. He has a reputation of honesty, but it is not enforced through virtue or reason.
 - i. "It will be clear enough then that in his ordinary dealings which give him a reputation for honesty he coerces his bad passions by an enforced virtue; not making them see that they are wrong, or taming them by reason, but by necessity and fear." P.159
 - e. He will seem more respectable than most people.
 - f. "he loses the prize and saves his money." P.159
 - g. In the end: "They themselves care only for making money, and are as indifferent as the pauper to the cultivation of virtue." P. 160
7. Change from Oligarchy to Democracy
 - a. Those in the oligarchical state cannot obtain "enough" wealth.
 - i. "The good at which such a State aims is to become as rich as possible, a desire which is insatiable?" p. 159

- b. Rulers don't restrain the spendthrift youth so they can take advantage of their weakness.
 - i. "The rulers, being aware that their power rests upon their wealth, refuse to curtail by law the extravagance of the spendthrift youth because they gain by their ruin; they take interest from them and buy up their estates and thus increase their own wealth and importance?" p. 159
 - c. Many are reduced to beggary, and they remain in the state "fully armed and ready to sting."
 - d. Many whisper of revolution when they see that the rulers are weak.
 - i. "... and they hate and conspire against those who have got their property, and against everybody else, and are eager for revolution." P. 160
 - ii. "... how can he avoid drawing the conclusion that men like him are only rich because no one has the courage to despoil despoil them?"
 - e. The state "falls sick, and is at war with herself.
 - i. "Democracy comes into being after the poor have conquered their opponents, slaughtering some and banishing some, while to the remainder they give an equal share of freedom and power..." P. 161
 - f. The city is "full of freedom and frankness."
 - g. Individuals can order their own life as they please.
 - h. The state has the "greatest variety of human natures".
 - i. This, then, seems likely to be the fairest of States, being like an embroidered robe which is spangled with every sort of flower." P.161
 - i. She tramples the fine pursuits of a statesman.
 - i. "See too, I said, the forgiving spirit of democracy, and the 'don't care' about trifles, and the disregard which she shows of all the fine principles which we solemnly laid down at the foundation of the city... never giving a thought to the pursuits which make a statesman, and promoting to honour any one who professes to be the people's friend." P.161
 - j. Equality and liberty run supreme.
 - i. "These and other kindred characteristics are proper to democracy, which is a charming form of government, full of variety and disorder, and dispensing a sort of equality." P.162
8. Who is the Democratic Man, and how is does he come to be?
- a. The oligarchical son is infected from without by associates.
 - i. "a young man who has been brought up as we were just now describing, in a vulgar and miserly way, has tasted drones' honey and has come to associate with fierce and crafty natures who are able to provide for him all sorts of refinements and varieties of pleasure—then, as you may imagine, the change will begin of the oligarchical principle within him into the democratical?" p.163
 - b. A division arises in his soul and he goes to war with himself, much the same way the state goes to war with itself in revolution.
 - i. This parallels the divide between rich and poor that Plato returns to again and again in cities that are mismanaged.
 - c. The spendthrift desires overcome the miserly desires, and this causes the man to want to indulge his every whim.
 - i. "There is a battle and they gain the day, and then modesty, which they call silliness, is ignominiously thrust into exile by them, and temperance, which they nickname unmanliness, is trampled in the mire and cast forth; they persuade

men that moderation and orderly expenditure are vulgarity and meanness, and so, by the help of a rabble of evil appetites, they drive them beyond the border." P.163

- d. All of the great ideas are turned upside down by a redefinition of terms.
 - i. "And when they have emptied and swept clean the soul of him who is now in their power and who is being initiated by them in great mysteries, the next thing is to bring back to their house insolence and anarchy and waste and impudence in bright array having garlands on their heads, and a great company with them, hymning their praises and calling them by sweet names; insolence they term breeding, and anarchy liberty, and waste magnificence, and impudence courage. And so the young man passes out of his original nature, which was trained in the school of necessity, into the freedom and libertinism of useless and unnecessary pleasures." P.164
 - e. And the conversion is complete into the democratic man.
 - i. "... he lives from day to day indulging the appetite of the hour; and sometimes he is lapped in drink and strains of the flute; then he becomes a water-drinker, and tries to get thin; then he takes a turn at gymnastics; sometimes idling and neglecting everything, then once more living the life of a philosopher; often he is busy with politics, and starts to his feet and says and does whatever comes into his head; and, if he is emulous of any one who is a warrior, off he is in that direction, or of men of business, once more in that. His life has neither law nor order; and this distracted existence he terms joy and bliss and freedom; and so he goes on." P.164
 - ii. "... his life is motley and manifold and an epitome of the lives of many;—he answers to the State which we described as fair and spangled. And many a man and many a woman will take him for their pattern, and many a constitution and many an example of manners is contained in him." P.164
 - f. Later in the beginning of Book 9, Plato summarizes the Democratic Man as such:
 - i. "And now remember the character which we attributed to the democratic man. He was supposed from his youth upwards to have been trained under a miserly parent, who encouraged the saving appetites in him, but discountenanced the unnecessary, which aim only at amusement and ornament? And then he got into the company of a more refined, licentious sort of people, and taking to all their wanton ways rushed into the opposite extreme from an abhorrence of his father's meanness. At last, being a better man than his corruptors, he was drawn in both directions until he halted midway and led a life, not of vulgar and slavish passion, but of what he deemed moderate indulgence in various pleasures." P.171
9. The change from Democracy to Tyranny.
- a. The fall of Democracy. (quotation beginning on p.165)
 - "When a democracy which is thirsting for freedom has evil cup-bearers presiding over the feast, and has drunk too deeply of the strong wine of freedom, then, unless her rulers are very amenable and give a plentiful draught, she calls them to account and punishes them, and says that they are cursed oligarchs."
 - "Yes, he replied, a very common occurrence."
 - "Yes, I said; and loyal citizens are insultingly termed by her slaves who hug their chains and men of naught; she would have subjects who are like rulers,

and rulers who are like subjects: these are men after her own heart, whom she praises and honours both in private and public. Now, in such a State, can liberty have any limit?"

"Certainly not."

"By degrees the anarchy finds a way into private houses, and ends by getting among the animals and infecting them."

"How do you mean?"

"I mean that the father grows accustomed to descend to the level of his sons and to fear them, and the son is on a level with his father, he having no respect or reverence for either of his parents; and this is his freedom, and the metic is equal with the citizen and the citizen with the metic, and the stranger is quite as good as either."

....

"And above all, I said, and as the result of all, see how sensitive the citizens become; they chafe impatiently at the least touch of authority, and at length, as you know, they cease to care even for the laws, written or unwritten; they will have no one over them."

"Yes, he said, I know it too well."

"Such, my friend, I said, is the fair and glorious beginning out of which springs tyranny."

"Glorious indeed, he said. But what is the next step?"

"The ruin of oligarchy is the ruin of democracy; the same disease magnified and intensified by liberty overmasters democracy—the truth being that the excessive increase of anything often causes a reaction in the opposite direction; and this is the case not only in the seasons and in vegetable and animal life, but above all in forms of government."

"True. The excess of liberty, whether in States or individuals, seems only to pass into excess of slavery."

"Yes, the natural order."

"And so tyranny naturally arises out of democracy, and the most aggravated form of tyranny and slavery out of the most extreme form of liberty?"

b. The Rise of Tyranny. (beginning on p.167

"Do not their leaders deprive the rich of their estates and distribute them among the people; at the same time taking care to reserve the larger part for themselves?"

"Why, yes, he said, to that extent the people do share.?"

"And the persons whose property is taken from them are compelled to defend themselves before the people as they best can.?"

"What else can they do.?"

"And then, although they may have no desire of change, the others charge them with plotting against the people and being friends of oligarchy.?"

"True..?"

"And the end is that when they see the people, not of their own accord, but through ignorance, and because they are deceived by informers, seeking to do them wrong, then at last they are forced to become oligarchs in reality; they do not wish to be, but the sting of the drones torments them and breeds revolution in them."

"That is exactly the truth."

“Then come impeachments and judgments and trials of one another.”

“True.”

“The people have always some champion whom they set over them and nurse into greatness.”

“Yes, that is their way..”

“This and no other is the root from which a tyrant springs; when he first appears above ground he is a protector..”

“Yes, that is quite clear..”

“How then does a protector begin to change into a tyrant? Clearly when he does what the man is said to do in the tale of the Arcadian temple of Lycaean Zeus..”

“What tale?”

“The tale is that he who has tasted the entrails of a single human victim minced up with the entrails of other victims is destined to become a wolf. Did you never hear it?”

“Oh, yes..”

“And the protector of the people is like him; having a mob entirely at his disposal, he is not restrained from shedding the blood of kinsmen; by the favourite method of false accusation he brings them into court and murders them, making the life of man to disappear, and with unholy tongue and lips tasting the blood of his fellow citizens; some he kills and others he banishes, at the same time hinting at the abolition of debts and partition of lands: and after this, what will be his destiny? Must he not either perish at the hands of his enemies, or from being a man become a wolf—that is, a tyrant?”

“Inevitably..”

“This, I said, is he who begins to make a party against the rich?”

“The same..”

“After a while he is driven out, but comes back, in spite of his enemies, a tyrant full grown..”

“That is clear..”

“And if they are unable to expel him, or to get him condemned to death by a public accusation, they conspire to assassinate him..”

“Yes, he said, that is their usual way..”

“Then comes the famous request for a body-guard, which is the device of all those who have got thus far in their tyrannical career—'Let not the people's friend,' as they say, 'be lost to them.'”

“Exactly..”

“The people readily assent; all their fears are for him—they have none for themselves.

- c. At this point the tyrant begins to consolidate power, and eventually becomes unpopular. But by that time it is too late.
 - i. He liberated debtors, and distributed land to buy allies.
 - ii. He stirs up wars to necessitate a strong leader.
 - iii. He impoverishes the people with taxes to keep them focused on daily needs so they can't organize.
 - iv. He sends dissidents to the front lines, so he always needs a war.

- v. The constant warring makes him unpopular, and when any remaining in power confront him, he must get rid of them. So he purges the state of those who are not loyal.
- vi. He sets the slaves free, and enlists them as his most trusted bodyguards.
- vii. He starts to run short on money, so he confiscates the treasures of the state and sells them.
- viii. In the end he will rely on his own wealth to support his rule. Stealing it from his father if he is still alive.

Book 9

1. Before we dive deeper into the nature of the Tyrannical man, Socrates diverts to talk about the nature and number of the appetites.
 - a. Some Unnecessary Pleasures are also unlawful. But people control them with reason.
 - b. In dreams the “wild beast within us” can run unchecked, particularly if we indulge our desires too much while we are awake.
 - c. “But when a man's pulse is healthy and temperate, and when before going to sleep he has awakened his rational powers, and fed them on noble thoughts and enquiries, collecting himself in meditation; after having first indulged his appetites neither too much nor too little, but just enough to lay them to sleep, and prevent them and their enjoyments and pains from interfering with the higher principle—which he leaves in the solitude of pure abstraction, free to contemplate and aspire to the knowledge of the unknown, whether in past, present, or future: when again he has allayed the passionate element, if he has a quarrel against any one—I say, when, after pacifying the two irrational principles, he rouses up the third, which is reason, before he takes his rest, then, as you know, he attains truth most nearly, and is least likely to be the sport of fantastic and lawless visions.” P.171
 - d. “In saying this I have been running into a digression; but the point which I desire to note is that in all of us, even in good men, there is a lawless wild-beast nature, which peers out in sleep.” P.171
2. Who is the Tyrannical Man and how does he come to be?
 - a. Plato draws the image of an indulgent boy, who has a beast inside him that he cannot forever contain.
 - b. As a boy, the tyrant is: “drawn into a perfectly lawless life, which by his seducers is termed perfect liberty; and his father and friends take part with his moderate desires, and the opposite party assist the opposite ones. As soon as these dire magicians and tyrant-makers find that they are losing their hold on him, they contrive to implant in him a master passion, to be lord over his idle and spendthrift spendthrift lusts—a sort of monstrous winged drone—that is the only image which will adequately describe him.” P.172
 - c. “And when his other lusts, amid clouds of incense and perfumes and garlands and wines, and all the pleasures of a dissolute life, now let loose, come buzzing around him, nourishing to the utmost the sting of desire which they implant in his drone-like nature, then at last this lord of the soul, having Madness for the captain of his guard, breaks out into a frenzy: and if he finds in himself any good opinions or appetites in process of formation, and there is in him any sense of shame remaining, to these better principles he puts an end, and casts them forth until he has purged away temperance and brought in madness to the full.” P.172
 - d. The Tyrannical Man is a slave to Love and his passions.
 - i. “... the tyrannical man in the true sense of the word comes into being when, either under the influence of nature, or habit, or both, he becomes drunken, lustful, passionate?” p.172
 - ii. “... that there will be feasts and carousals and revellings and courtezans, and all that sort of thing; Love is the lord of the house within him, and orders all the concerns of his soul.” P.172

- iii. "... old opinions which he had when a child, and which gave judgment about good and evil, are overthrown by those others which have just been emancipated, and are now the body-guard of love and share his empire. These in his democratic days, when he was still subject to the laws and to his father, were only let loose in the dreams of sleep. But now that he is under the dominion of love, he becomes always and in waking reality what he was then very rarely and in a dream only; he will commit the foulest murder, or eat forbidden food, or be guilty of any other horrid act. Love is his tyrant, and lives lordly in him and lawlessly, and being himself a king, leads him on, as a tyrant leads a State, to the performance of any reckless deed by which he can maintain himself and the rabble of his associates, whether those whom evil communications have brought in from without, or those whom he himself has allowed to break loose within him by reason of a similar evil nature in himself." P.172
 - iv. "When such men are only private individuals and before they get power, this is their character; they associate entirely with their own flatterers or ready tools; or if they want anything from anybody, they in their turn are equally ready to bow down before them: they profess every sort of affection for them; but when they have gained their point they know them no more." P. 174
- 3. Which Individual is the best/happiest?
 - a. King is happiest, and the others less so down the tyrannical man.
- 4. Discuss the three parts of the soul
 - a. Learning – Lovers of Wisdom (experience, wisdom, reason)
 - i. "... are we to suppose, I said, that the philosopher sets any value on other pleasures in comparison with the pleasure of knowing the truth, and in that pursuit abiding, ever learning, not so far indeed from the heaven of pleasure? Does he not call the other pleasures necessary, under the idea that if there were no necessity for them, he would rather not have them?" p. 178
 - b. Passionate – Lovers of Honor (honor, victory, courage)
 - i. "... pleasure of riches is vulgar, while the pleasure of learning, if it brings no distinction, is all smoke and nonsense to him?" p.178
 - c. Appetitive – Lovers of Gain (wealth and gain)
 - i. "... the money-maker will contrast the vanity of honour or of learning if they bring no money with the solid advantages of gold and silver?" p.178
- 5. Socrates then "stacks the deck" in favor of the "lovers of wisdom" when trying to determine which of these ways is the most "pleasurable," by making experience, wisdom and reason the criterion for resolving the question.
 - a. "... what ought to be the criterion? Is any better than experience and wisdom and reason? P.179
 - b. "... And so we arrive at the result, that the pleasure of the intelligent part of the soul is the pleasantest of the three, and that he of us in whom this is the ruling principle has the pleasantest life." P.179
 - c. "Unquestionably, he said, the wise man speaks with authority when he approves of his own life." P.179
 - d. The lover of Honor is deemed second.
 - e. The lover of Gain is deemed last, when considering pleasures.
- 6. Socrates uses dialectic to attempt to prove that no other pleasure except the pleasure of attaining wisdom is true and pure.

- a. He shows that the absence of pain is pleasure, and the absence of pleasure is pain.
 - b. So, the state of resting after each is both pleasure and pain.
 - c. But pleasure and pain are both motions of the soul.
 - d. So, how can they be both rest and motion at once?
 - e. He concludes that this type of pleasure and pain is “appearance only.”
 - f. Further, bodily pleasures could all be classed as a cessation of pain and the reverse also.
 - g. “Then can you wonder that persons who are inexperienced in the truth, as they have wrong ideas about many other things, should also have wrong ideas about pleasure and pain and the intermediate state; so that when they are only being drawn towards the painful they feel pain and think the pain which they experience to be real, and in like manner, when drawn away from pain to the neutral or intermediate state, they firmly believe that they have reached the goal of satiety and pleasure; they, not knowing pleasure, err in contrasting pain with the absence of pain, which is like contrasting black with grey instead of white—can you wonder, I say, at this?” p.181
 - h. “What classes of things have a greater share of pure existence in your judgment—those of which food and drink and condiments and all kinds of sustenance are examples, or the class which contains true opinion and knowledge and mind and all the different kinds of virtue? Put the question in this way:—Which has a more pure being—that which is concerned with the invariable, the immortal, and the true, and is of such a nature, and is found in such natures; or that which is concerned with and found in the variable and mortal, and is itself variable and mortal?” p.182
 - i. “Those then who know not wisdom and virtue, and are always busy with gluttony and sensuality, go down and up again as far as the mean; and in this region they move at random throughout life, but they never pass into the true upper world; thither they neither look, nor do they ever find their way, neither are they truly filled with true being, nor do they taste of pure and abiding pleasure. Like cattle, with their eyes always looking down and their heads stooping to the earth, that is, to the dining-table, they fatten and feed and breed, and, in their excessive love of these delights, they kick and butt at one another with horns and hoofs which are made of iron; and they kill one another by reason of their insatiable lust. For they fill themselves themselves with that which is not substantial, and the part of themselves which they fill is also unsubstantial and incontinent.” P.182
7. Bringing it all home, Socrates concludes:
- “And is not that farthest from reason which is at the greatest distance from law and order?”
- “Clearly.”
- “And the lustful and tyrannical desires are, as we saw, at the greatest distance? Yes. And the royal and orderly desires are nearest??”
- “Yes.”
- “Then the tyrant will live at the greatest distance from true or natural pleasure, and the king at the least?”
- “Certainly.” p.183
8. In fact, Socrates calculates that the King would live a life 729 times more pleasurable to the Tyrant.
 9. Socrates proposes we create an “ideal image of the soul.”
 - a. Join together a multi-headed monster, a lion and a man.
 - b. A just man must keep the three in harmony.

- i. "To him the supporter of justice makes answer that he should ever so speak and act as to give the man within him in some way or other the most complete mastery over the entire human creature. He should watch over the many-headed monster like a good husbandman, fostering and cultivating the gentle qualities, and preventing the wild ones from growing; he should be making the lion-heart his ally, and in common care of them all should be uniting the several parts with one another and with himself." P.185
- ii. "... every one had better be ruled by divine wisdom dwelling within him; or, if this be impossible, then by an external authority, in order that we may be all, as far as possible, under the same government, friends and equals." P.186
- iii. "He will look at the city which is within him, and take heed that no disorder occur in it, such as might arise either from superfluity or from want; and upon this principle he will regulate his property and gain or spend according to his means." P.186

Book 10

1. Socrates attacks the tragedians in defense of philosophy.
 - a. "... all poetical imitations are ruinous to the understanding of the hearers, and that the knowledge of their true nature is the only antidote to them." P.187
2. We discuss the meaning of "imitation." Introduction of "the Forms" although it is not developed in the Republic.
 - a. Three artists:
 - i. The maker of all the works of all workmen, all things and even the gods.
GAoTU
 - ii. A builder of material objects.
 - iii. Painters, poets who imitate objects.
 - b. Tragic poets are imitators.
 - i. "Then the imitator, I said, is a long way off the truth, and can do all things because he lightly touches on a small part of them, and that part an image. For example: A painter will paint a cobbler, carpenter, or any other artist, though he knows nothing of their arts; and, if he is a good artist, he may deceive children or simple persons, when he shows them his picture of a carpenter from a distance, and they will fancy that they are looking at a real carpenter... And whenever any one informs us that he has found a man who knows all the arts, and all things else that anybody knows, and every single thing with a higher degree of accuracy than any other man—whoever tells us this, I think that we can only imagine him to be a simple creature who is likely to have been deceived by some wizard or actor whom he met, and whom he thought all-knowing, because he himself was unable to analyse the nature of knowledge and ignorance and imitation."
 - ii. "And so, when we hear persons saying that the tragedians, and Homer, who is at their head, know all the arts and all things human, virtue as well as vice, and divine things too, for that the good poet cannot compose well unless he knows his subject, and that he who has not this knowledge can never be a poet, we ought to consider whether here also there may not be a similar illusion. Perhaps they may have come across imitators and been deceived by them; they may not have remembered when they saw their works that these were but imitations thrice removed from the truth, and could easily be made without any knowledge of the truth, because they are appearances only and not realities?" p.190
 - iii. "Protagoras of Abdera, and Prodicus of Ceos, and a host of others, have only to whisper to their contemporaries: 'You will never be able to manage either your own house or your own State until you appoint us to be your ministers of education'—and this ingenious device of theirs has such an effect in making men love them that their companions all but carry them about on their shoulders." P.191
 - iv. "Thus far then we are pretty well agreed that the imitator has no knowledge worth mentioning of what he imitates. Imitation is only a kind of play or sport, and the tragic poets, whether they write in Iambic or in Heroic verse, are imitators in the highest degree?" p.192
3. Three arts of every item:

- a. User
 - b. Maker
 - c. Imitator
4. The rational part of the soul saves the observer from error.
 5. Imitators play to the base nature of man, not reason. He “indulges the irrational nature.”
 - a. “Then the imitative poet who aims at being popular is not by nature made, nor is his art intended, to please or to affect the rational principle in the soul; but he will prefer the passionate and fitful temper, which is easily imitated?” p.195
 - b. “Then the imitative poet who aims at being popular is not by nature made, nor is his art intended, to please or to affect the rational principle in the soul; but he will prefer the passionate and fitful temper, which is easily imitated?” p.195
 6. Socrates backs up to talk about the immortality of the soul. And he seeks to prove it.
 - a. Good and evil exist.
 - b. Evil is the destructive force bringing an end to a thing and good the opposite.
 - c. Anything that perishes is subject to good and evil.
 - d. “If, then, we find any nature which having this inherent corruption cannot be dissolved or destroyed, we may be certain that of such a nature there is no destruction?” p.197
 - e. “Consider the soul in like manner. Does the injustice or other evil which exists in the soul waste and consume her? Do they by attaching to the soul and inhering in her at last bring her to death, and so separate her from the body?” p.198
 7. Socrates concludes that Justice is good for man.
 - a. “... justice in her own nature has been shown to be best for the soul in her own nature. Let a man do what is just, whether he have the ring of Gyges or not, and even if in addition to the ring of Gyges he put on the helmet of Hades.” P. 199
 - b. “Then, as the cause is decided, I demand on behalf of justice that the estimation in which she is held by gods and men and which we acknowledge to be her due should now be restored to her by us; since she has been shown to confer reality, and not to deceive those who truly possess her, let what has been taken from her be given back, that so she may win that palm of appearance which is hers also, and which she gives to her own.” P.200
 - c. “Then this must be our notion of the just man, that even when he is in poverty or sickness, or any other seeming misfortune, all things will in the end work together for good to him in life and death: for the gods have a care of any one whose desire is to become just and to be like God, as far as man can attain the divine likeness, by the pursuit of virtue?” p.200
 8. Socrates concludes that the Just are rewarded as the “unjust” were supposed to be rewarded at the start of the exercise (in book 5).
 9. Socrates then moves to tell the tale of Er the son of Armenius.
 - a. Dies and goes to a place of judges where people arrive from thousands of years in punishment or in heaven. They gather there and tell of their experiences.
 - b. And they witness some tyrants and other wicked men being taken off to a place where they will never return. The example was given of a tyrant named Ardiaeus.
 - i. “Ardiaeus appeared and several others, most of whom were tyrants; and there were also besides the tyrants private individuals who had been great criminals: they were just, as they fancied, about to return into the upper world, but the mouth, instead of admitting them, gave a roar, whenever any of these incurable sinners or some one who had not been sufficiently

punished tried to ascend; and then wild men of fiery aspect, who were standing by and heard the sound, seized and carried them off; and Ardiaeus and others they bound head and foot and hand, and threw them down and flayed them with scourges, and dragged them along the road at the side, carding them on thorns like wool, and declaring to the passers-by what were their crimes, and that they were being taken away to be cast into hell.” P.202

- c. Ur continues on a journey to “a place where they could see from above a line of light, straight as a column, extending right through the whole heaven and through the earth, in colour resembling the rainbow, only brighter and purer.” P.202
 - i. He goes on about the details of this place creating a detailed tapestry.
 - ii. A prophet comes and tells each that they must choose a new life. There were men, animals and lives of tyrants and heroes.
 - iii. Socrates relates the “Way of Happiness”
 1. “Let each one of us leave every other kind of knowledge and seek and follow one thing only, if peradventure he may be able to learn and may find some one who will make him able to learn and discern between good and evil, and so to choose always and everywhere the better life as he has opportunity. He should consider the bearing of all these things which have been mentioned severally and collectively upon virtue; he should know what the effect of beauty is when combined with poverty or wealth in a particular soul, and what are the good and evil consequences of noble and humble birth, of private and public station, of strength and weakness, of cleverness and dullness, and of all the natural and acquired gifts of the soul, and the operation of them when conjoined; he will then look at the nature of the soul, and from the consideration of all these qualities he will be able to determine which is the better and which is the worse; and so he will choose, giving the name of evil to the life which will make his soul more unjust, and good to the life which will make his soul more just; all else he will disregard. For we have seen and know that this is the best choice both in life and after death. A man must take with him into the world below an adamantine faith in truth and right, that there too he may be undazzled by the desire of wealth or the other allurements of evil, lest, coming upon tyrannies and similar villainies, he do irremediable wrongs to others and suffer yet worse himself; but let him know how to choose the mean and avoid the extremes on either side, as far as possible, not only in this life but in all that which is to come. For this is the way of happiness.” P.203
 - iv. Many heroes each choose new lives according to their former experience.
 - v. Once chosen, each move on to the river of Unmindfulness.
 - vi. And Ur does not drink, but is returned to his body to awaken on his pyre and tell of these things.
10. Socrates concludes the Republic with a hopeful blessing of sorts.
 - a. “Wherefore my counsel is, that we hold fast ever to the heavenly way and follow after justice and virtue always, considering that the soul is immortal and able to endure every sort of good and every sort of evil. Thus shall we live dear to one

another and to the gods, both while remaining here and when, like conquerors in the games who go round to gather gifts, we receive our reward. And it shall be well with us both in this life and in the pilgrimage of a thousand years which we have been describing." P. 206